"Making It Real"

Mainstreaming Race Equality

cemvo

Strengthening Communities Tackling Inequalities

SCOTLAND

EFQM®

Committed to excellence

1. Background

CEMVO Scotland has been funded by the Scottish Government to assist organisations to 'mainstream' race equality. Details of the kind of assistance available can be found at the end of this report.

The report itself is a summary of a series of events that were held aimed at engaging with all who have an interest in making this happen, including those who already know how, as well as those who want to know how. There were 3 events held across Scotland between June 2011 and September 2011 and the programme concluded with a debate chaired by Claudia Beamish MSP and the Convener of the Scottish Parliament's Equal Opportunities Committee in the second half of 2011. Also speaking were Humza Yousaf MSP, Hanzala Malik MSP and Martin Hayward from the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC).

In total, we engaged with over 100 people from both the public and third sectors. Feedback forms indicated that approximately 50% of those attending felt that the opportunity had improved their understanding of mainstreaming 'a lot' whilst around 33% said that it had increased their awareness of how to do their own work better. There was also an overwhelmingly positive response in relation to the opportunities presented for networking throughout the days.

The timing of this work is particularly important due to recent legislative requirements in relation to mainstreaming.

[As a note to readers, the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012 state that: *A listed authority must publish a report on the progress it has made to* mainstream *the equality duty not later than 30th April 2013 and subsequently every 2 years.*]

Claudia Beamish MSP

**Speaker at
Stirling Event**

The EOC has recently written to all government departments seeking information about how equality is promoted and mainstreamed – based on our belief that if they start to look at the situation right from stage 1 of budgetary processes it will be easier to affect change.

Humza Yousaf MSP

**Speaker at
Edinburgh Event**

Political parties can be guilty of propagating difference through classification systems which make people 'choose' a single identity and which leads other people to question national loyalty.

Hanzala Malik MSP

**Speaker at
Stirling Event**

Our workforce still does not reflect BME communities – there is a lot of lip service but no real change. People like policy and one off initiatives – but it is not sustained.

2. Introduction

We know that ethnic inequalities do exist because we can refer to any number of legacy reports including:

- The Black Leadership Network's report 'Still a Fair Way to Go' (a discussion paper on NHS Scotland) 2008 which stated: *'Action Plans need to evidence actual change that is taking place on the ground, as opposed to emphasising indicators of activity or process.'*

- Audit Scotland's Report on the impact of the race equality duty on Councils, 2008: *'Councils lack full and robust information about minority ethnic communities and their needs'*

- Scottish Social Attitudes Survey 2010: Almost half (48%) of those interviewed felt that providing training through positive action measures to Black or Asian staff would be unfair.

We also know from these reports that mainstreaming has not been widely successful to date.

But is everyone clear about the definition? Evidence gathering shows that there are multiple ways to define the concept. CEMVO Scotland believes the debate on how to make mainstreaming happen is best served by keeping any definition simple and consistent. For these reasons, we would commend the definition used by the Equality & Human Rights Commission [EHRC] in their presentation:

EHRC

Mainstreaming is when an authority, in carrying out its' functions, takes equality into account

This involves embedding equality across an authority's policies, procedures and corporate systems such as business planning and reporting cycles

Equality is not a marginal or specialist activity but is a key component of what your authority does

Mainstreaming equality can improve the quality of what you do.

The following sections set out to offer a snapshot of the issues which emerged as we engaged with a diverse audience of people at different places across Scotland. We have tried to capture, firstly, what 'mainstreaming' equality means to people in the current climate, then identified what some of the main barriers and challenges are, shared ideas on both how to make progress as well as how we will know when we have achieved it, and finally considered mechanisms to minimise the risk of slipping backwards at any point in the future. An unplanned focus on mainstreaming v specialist services during feedback sessions in all 3 events has led to a specific section being built into the report on this.

It is important therefore that the report is not read as a definitive guidance on mainstreaming as many articles

and guidelines already exist such as http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/47095/0025589.pdf and http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/Research-BriefingsAndFactsheets/S4/SB11-69.pdf)

It is rather to provide an up to date illustration of the views of those working in the field to help inform future development and improvement for us all. Our thanks to all of the speakers and participants and we hope that their comments and ideas are accurately represented by the bullet points throughout this report.

3. The challenges we (the public sector and EM sector) are facing in mainstreaming race equality

- The current position is frustrating for both public/private sector organisations and ethnic minority (EM) led organisations

- Current work on 'mainstreaming is seen to be tokenistic, not strategic

- Some grassroots organisations have disconnected due to a lack of progress; this in turn means they are less likely to make complaints or raise concerns

- Mainstreaming organisations are still not always aware of the situation on the ground e.g. a response from a GP practice 'no English, no doctor'

- There is a continuing lack of robust data and evidence on EM inequalities, especially in health

- Many do not recognise the existence of increasingly sophisticated and covert discrimination and so do not challenge it

- In the current climate, hierarchies and lack of collaboration have developed between equality groups. The EM sector needs to work together and coordinate priorities/outcomes for mainstreaming race equality

- The current position of Single Outcome Agreements and the Concordat needs to be revisited to ensure that equality outcomes are developed which are more specific, incremental and measureable

- People still need practical ideas for action. [Note: Further information can be found in toolkits such as: NHS Health Scotland's Checking for Change http://www.healthscotland.com/documents/2488.aspx ; Universities Scotland's toolkit http://www.universities-scotland.ac.uk/raceequalitytoolkit/ ; and GCVS guidance for voluntary organisations http://es3s.org.uk/]

4. The tools we need to help mainstream race equality more effectively

- **Consensus:** Greater awareness and collective understanding, including what is meant by 'ethnic minorities' [diversity within and between communities needs to be recognised to remove 'one size fits all' approach] and 'accessible services'

- **Evidence:** With the exception of one, all organisations who attended felt they did not have sufficient baseline data on the needs of ethnic minority communities so:

  It was agreed that the most important 'tool' was to have both good qualitative and quantitative baseline data, regularly updated. This also has to lead to regular and robust analysis of data, as well as practical use of analysis outcomes. Ethnic minority partners can work with public sector to make findings more meaningful and understandable

  It was also noted that in some situations the evidence already exists – people either do not know where to look to find it or how to use it to bring about change so evidence gathering is repeated which can be a waste of time and energy

- **Leadership:** Stronger and more visible leadership from both Scottish Parliament and Scottish Government is needed to ensure that in the current economic climate, which increasingly encourages short term thinking, long term data analysis and work to change trends and patterns does not get dropped

- **Performance management:** New and creative performance audit tools/reviews, as well as easy access to practical examples of good practice

- **Community participation:** Improved civic engagement methods and networking opportunities

---

CEMVO Scotland: For consultation to be effective:

Acknowledge continuing exclusion and racism

Understand difference between equal (fair) treatment according to need and treating everyone the same

---

Utilise knowledge and experience of EM employees, members of the public and specialist organisations

---

Users of services are best placed to assess progress, or lack of it, as well as hold people to account

5. Some of the 'how tos' for making progress in mainstreaming race equality

- Set milestones and performance indicators which will help move from outputs (activities) to outcomes (change)

- Challenge the status quo, for example common practice of using internal-only recruitment (which has an even more adverse impact as a result of current recruitment freezes)

- Move beyond minimum compliance or simply following the 'letter of the law'

- Link service delivery and workforce issues, particularly in sectors such as education

- Put processes in place to find out what is not working earlier rather than reacting only when there is a crisis or complaint

- Begin to focus on needs of younger/ future generations

- Increase understanding of the business case i.e., recognising the benefits of diversity and be better able to argue the case for public spending for example, if one person is eligible to get more than another person, why is this the case?

- Encourage a rights based approach: individuals need to be enabled to take responsibility to make claims for change and hold people to account

- Improve feedback to EM people who participated in one off consultation exercises

- Public bodies need to see and understand the bigger picture, how their works fits and how they can influence national issues of procurement, influence of the media, hate crime etc

- Public bodies should market their services better

- Decision makers should understand the power relationships involved and recognize, acknowledge and deal with possible institutional discrimination

- Develop more effective models of partnership working and power sharing

6. Indicators for success in mainstreaming race equality

- An organisational framework is published where legal requirements and other equality measures, such as positive action, can be placed

- Sustained involvement of the right EM people at the right time in EQIAs (Equality Impact Assessments) and policy formulation

- Increased input from EM staff

- Expectations are met from both service users and providers (use of satisfaction surveys)

- Equality is built into personal objectives (Key Performance Indicators) of senior management and there is clear accountability

- Work is more strategic rather than based on one-off projects

- Systems and processes continue when individual champions or equality managers leave the organisation, i.e., mainstreaming is everyone's responsibility

- Graduate traineeships and secondments of EM managers into strategic, policy making organisations including the Scottish Government

- Organisational accountability and clear chains of responsibility to chief executive officers (CEOs) and boards

- More open discussions and challenging of workforce banter and corridor discussions

- Positive action is understood and used more effectively (clarity is needed on positive action v positive discrimination and/or good practice) in order to address under respresentation at all levels of workforce

- Robust evidence/statistics collated and utilised in a meaningful way to inform decisions/measure outcomes

- Commercial/business success through EM businesses gaining real access to procurement activity of public sector bodies e.g. catering, training, interpreting etc.

- Performance indicators and outcomes agreed in partnership between service providers and service users

- Complacency removed through robust analysis of data e.g. complaints, satisfaction surveys etc (however if no negative feedback or challenges are highlighted this may indicate need for further investigation e.g. 100% positive feedback should always be questioned)

- More EM senior and middle managers

- Scottish Government shows leadership by building in core objectives into elected officer's/chief executive officer's job descriptions and personal specifications (and which can then be replicated within public sector organisations)

- Good practice shared between sectors

- Race equality integrated into the heart of all levels of decision making, including budgets

7. Mainstreaming race equality v specialist services to EM communities

- Should not be seen as 'either/or' but rather both approaches should be complimentary

- Greater recognition by public/private sector organisation about the role of specialist services

- Dual role - help public/private sector services become better equipped to use specialist support

- Specialist services will be required for as long as there are unmet needs

- Use practical examples to argue the case for continuing specialist provision rather than using 'belief' arguments

- Specialist services must not be diluted or eliminated because individuals will suffer

- Specialist services need to lead mainstreaming services not the other way round

- Specialist knowledge essential for mainstream organisational development and therefore needs to remain at the heart of mainstreaming work

- Specialist services are a bridge - joint assessment could be considered between core and specialist service providers in order to identify individual needs of service users

- Specialist services could become core services and incorporated into the organisation as a whole

- Enhance voice of service providers – often operational staff recognise the need and want it to continue, but policy makers in isolation make the decision to stop it

- Specialist services are not just about welfare provision, they can also offer quality training, research etc, from an EM perspective

- Specialist services need to be more creative about the resources needed e.g., consider social enterprise, private sponsorship and support in kind – this will ultimately give greater flexibility and freedom

Scottish Government (Mainstreaming Equal Opportunities):

PROBLEM: misunderstanding of the concept of mainstreaming by assuming that it replaces specific equalities initiatives

RISKS: equalities issues might become diluted or even disappear

POTENTIAL CORRECTIVES: retention of specific equalities policy machinery and specific equalities policy work

8. Summary and conclusion

Mainstreaming race equality – ensuring we don't slip backwards

Note: Mainstreaming builds on the legal requirements and steps to be taken e.g., training, monitoring, community engagement, setting outcomes by constantly reviewing and learning from what has been put in place and then amending and improving policy and practice on an on-going basis.

- Monitoring must move from 'number crunching' to effective analysis and use of findings

- We should not be afraid to talk about 'racism', 'institutional discrimination' and 'rights' in order to clarify why people are doing what they do and to address the organisational and cultural shift which needs to take place

- The focus has been on service delivery and now we should focus on building diversity in workforces – particularly at senior levels

- EM groups must develop a clearer take on what they want and need e.g. outcomes

- Greater accountability to communities and service users will help everyone as the users of services are best placed to say if and when real change takes place

- Evidence suggests that people are still struggling with developing effective community engagement – despite a wealth of guidance so greater practical support is needed on 'how to' along with better use of community based trainers

- Focus should be maintained on race equality as an ongoing concern– but with clearer links to overarching issues of poverty and disadvantage

- In relation to specialist services, these are tied very strongly to funding. The potential disproportionate impact of public sector cuts on EM communities and families could have far reaching implications in relation to meeting the general duty of the Equality Act 2010

- In the current climate, hierarchies and lack of collaboration exist between equality groups. The EM sector urgently needs to work together to coordinate and highlight national gaps/priorities/outcomes for mainstreaming race equality (localism debate should not be allowed to detract from these)

- The Equal Opportunities Committee (EOC) of the Scottish Parliament should build on its good work e.g., consider use of special rapporteurs

Mainstreaming race equality: the role of inspection and audit bodies

Inspection and audit bodies have a central role to play in finding (and testing) the evidence that public bodies demonstrate through current self assessment processes and which should show how the provider is sustaining progress in meeting the general duty.

- It is unclear **who will/should review progress on mainstreaming**. If this does not happen then things are unlikely to change

- More discussion is needed about a 'carrot and stick' approach eg public bodies definitely require support & encouragement in order to mainstream race equality but there should also be stronger sanctions where resistance or blocks are found

- No one has a formal policing role

  Is there a role for the voluntary sector to play eg regularly challenging lack of progress?

- Should the Scottish Government Equalities Unit take on this role?

- Could Ombudsmen services come together?

- Great organisational accountability needed from public bodies; CEOs are ultimately responsible but it is not clear to whom

- Equalities should be part of performance management systems but perhaps clearer audit indicators should be developed which can measure impact and quality of services; EQIAs are central to this

- A national picture of progress would be helpful – is anyone currently collecting and analysing the data which would help to build this?

9. Mainstreaming race equality – what can CEMVO Scotland do?

Finally, this report is one of a series of briefings for the public, statutory and third sectors on understanding race equality. This information sharing forms part of our overarching mainstreaming programme. Support to individual organisations currently includes 4 key strands:

Ethnic Minority Community Engagement

We can work with mainstream organisations to organise and facilitate ethnic minority community engagement events at local, regional or national levels. These events can, for example, be for consulting with communities on policy or service development issues, such as setting local race equality outcomes.

Equality Impact Assessments

We can provide support to mainstream organisations in EQIA processes, in either organising community participation consultative groups or individual specialist ethnic minority input into Equality Impact Assessments, including identifying potential mitigating measures and advice on publishing. We are also planning to develop practical guidance on improving the quality of EQIAs written from a community perspective and based on learning from across the EM sector.

Equalities Consultancy Support

We can provide 3 days free consultancy support to mainstream organisations by a small team of equality specialists. The team will provide guidance and support to review organisational culture including leadership, workforce and training, service provision, procurement etc, as well as provide a report detailing practical solutions. Race equality will underpin this area of consultancy work but it may be possible to cover other protected characteristics depending on the needs of individual organisations.

Information sharing

Further briefings on key issues e.g., race equality outcomes and positive action will be published during the second year of the project. We are also planning to hold a further national debate on mainstreaming in late 2012/early 2013.

For further information on any of our mainstreaming work please contact:

Eleanor McKnight or Fiaz Khan
CEMVO Scotland
Lancefield House,
95-107 Lancefield Street
GLASGOW G3 8HZ

Tel: 0141 248 4830
Email:
Eleanor.mcknight@cemvoscotland.org.uk
and Fiaz.Khan@cemvoscotland.org.uk

Appendix 1

Summary of Debates's Question and Answer Session

Q. How can public bodies (PBs) keep doing good work if they always get 'shot down' be the media, for example regular Freedom of Information requests asking about money spent, training of staff etc..?

A. Both PBs and EM orgs can and should write in to the paper in question and provide an alternative viewpoint based on more accurate facts. But also recognise that it is realistic to be challenged (EM groups constantly face this) and if the systems and processes are in place you should be able to justify your position and decisions

Q. Some concerns about Scottish Social Attitudes Survey in relation to positive action and wonder if it the way the questions was asked?

A. How questions are asked can be very important as badly worded, will indeed encourage a negative response. EM groups should be part of the research development process. We also need to question the current 'mainstream' and who defines what is mainstream. It should be seen in the context of power relationships and rights and why people are excluded in the first place.

Q. How can we change mindsets?

A. We need to make sure staff are trained. But there is a limit as to what can be addressed through education if there is wilful misunderstanding.

Q. Involvement of BME individuals in EQIA

A. Should be involved earlier, need additional resources, active rather than passive involvement, specialist expertise should be respected, greater feedback, transparency and accountability.

Q. Who currently monitors and gathers data?

A. Scottish Government don't but should have a role. NHS collect but in general do not analyse. Also little qualitative information collected eg satisfactions levels, outcomes etc. Absence of data can be an excuse to do nothing. But – we could collectively agree what data it is we want the Government in particular – as well as public bodies – to collect, analyse and publish

Collective approaches needed from bottom up also eg Dale Farm – power to bring about change.

Q. What will be impact of closing EHRC helpline?

A. Grassroots service provision will be needed even more. We need statistics on, and evidence of, people's experiences in order to set outcomes.

Appendix 2

Participants' list (by organization)

Action Group

African and Carribean Network

Afro Carribean Christian Fellowship

Algerian Society in Scotland

Alzheimer's Scotland

BEMIS

Big Lottery Fund

Black Leadership Network

Central Race Equality Council

Charity Education International

City of Edinburgh council

CORE

CRER

East Ayrshire Council

East Renfrewshire Council

East Dunbartonshire Council

Edinburgh Leisure

EHRC

EMLC

EOC, Scottish Parliament

Fife Police

First Glasgow

Frae Fife

Glasgow Housing Association

GCVS

Health Care Improvement Scotland

LEMAG

Lothian & Borders Police

MEAD

MEHIP

Migrants Rights Network

Momentum Scotland

Museum Galleries Scotland

Muslim Council of Scotland

Muslim Womens Resource Centre

NHS 24

NHS Fife

NHS Forth Valley

NHS Greater Glasgow

Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator

OSCR

Perth and Kinross Council

Pilotlight

RNiB

RSA

Saheliya

SC & SI Scotland

SCOAC

Scottish Court Service

Scottish Health Council Forth Valley

Scottish Parliament

SEMPER

Shakti Women's Aid

SIAA

Sikh Sanjog

Skills Development Scotland

Stirling Council

Strathclyde Police

STUC

The Peoples Academy Scotland

Trust Housing Association, Edinburgh

University of Stratchlyde

Victim Support

Volunteer Centre Edinburgh

Volunteer Development Scotland

West Lothian Council

WSREC

GICE

Glasgow Caledonian University

Glasgow City Council

Glasgow ESOL forum

SCORE Scotland

Scottish Ambulance Service

Scottish Council of African Churches

cemvo

Strengthening Communities
Tackling Inequalities

SCOTLAND

For further information please enquire to:

CEMVO Scotland
Lancefield House
1st floor, 95-107 Lancefield Street
Glasgow G3 8HZ
Tel: 0141 248 4830
Web: www.cemvoscotland.org.uk